

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES
109 James Street - Council Chambers
Geneva, Illinois 60134

March 18, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

1. Call to Order

Chairman Roy called the March 18, 2014 meeting of the Geneva Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. Roll call followed:

2. Roll Call

Present HPC: Chairman Roy, Commissioners Hiller, Schock-Soderberg, Zinke

Absent: Andersson, Ploppert

Staff Present: Preservation Planner Michael Lambert; Community Development Dir. Dick Untch

Others Present: Tad Hemming, 1224 Brigham Way, Geneva; Stephanie Krivus, 545 Blackhawk Dr., Batavia; Liz Safanda, 1013 Dunstan, Geneva; Architects Dave Myszka with K. Peterson Associates, Ken Overstreet (Avondale Custom Homes); Jim Bishop, 228 S 5th St., Geneva; and Recording Secretary Celeste Weilandt

3. Approval of the February 18, 2014 Minutes

The February 18, 2014 minutes were approved on motion by Commissioner Hiller, seconded by Commissioner Schock-Soderberg. Motion carried by voice vote of 4-0.

4. HPC Review of Building Permit Applications

A. 227 S. Third Street (Case No. 2014-004): Replacement of Door at Street Level: Applicant: Tad Hemming - Hemming Construction - Preservation Planner Lambert reviewed the location of the structure on two maps, noting the structure was listed as non-contributing in the 1999 Architectural Survey. The applicant was proposing to replace the wooden doors on the west elevation due to deterioration and age, as well as the doors on the south side which had the same issues. Per Mr. Lambert, the applicant is going to replace the doors with the same doors (Therma True doors) that are located on the second floor of the structure. Applicant, Mr. Hemming was present to answer questions. None followed. **Commissioner Hiller moved to approve the request for replacement doors for 227 S. Third Street, seconded by Commissioner Zinke. Roll call:**

Aye: Hiller, Shock-Soderberg, Zinke, Roy

Nay: None

MOTION CARRIED. VOTE: 4-0

B. 212 S. Fifth Street (Case No. 2004-006): Demolition of Non-historic Screened Porch: Replacement of Historic Cellar Bulkhead with Escape Window. Applicant: Avondale Customer Homes - Maurice McNally/Dave Myszka - Mr. Lambert recalled there was discussion at the November 2013 meeting of a concept review for modifications to the former Merritt King home that included the removal of the second floor screened porch. Since that time, the existing cellar door/bulkhead has been leaking, causing water running into the basement and the applicant would like to replace the door/bulkhead with an egress window. Photographs were shown. Per Lambert, the cellar currently exists at the corner of the original 1850's house where it intersects with the 1890's

house and collects water off the roof systems. The area is visible from the public right-of-way (ROW) on Campbell Street. Should the plans be approved for the proposed residences along Campbell, between Fifth and Sixth Streets, the egress window would not be visible from the ROW.

For the petitioner, architect Mr. Myszka, explained that there will be a partial wall built up underneath, with a metal egress well surround, and built up to code to alleviate some of the flooding that is occurring. Mr. Myszka explained that the cellar was constructed of rubble stone around the foundation with a concrete bulkhead on the inside. Mr. Myszka also stated he intends to remove as much of the rubble stone as possible, since it is already deteriorating and saving whatever stone is left to use in the garden.

Resident, Mr. Jim Bishop, 228 S. Fifth Street, who resides immediately south of Mr. King's house stated he sees the rear side of the screen porch from his home. As to the statements made that the screen porch is not historic while the garage has been relocated and is being classified as historic, Mr. Bishop reminded the commissioners that the Secretary of Interior (SOI) standards addressed how a structure evolves over time, and should be kept that way. To arbitrarily remove the porch went against the SOI standards. He asked to keep the porch in place since the home had gained historic value to the community.

Due to the above concerns, dialog followed by Mr. Myszka that he did not know exactly when the screened porch was added but indicated the garage was relocated in the 1950's from its original location along Campbell and the screen porch was added when the garage was moved -- probably around 1953. The condition of the current porch was open construction underneath and decking. Per Commissioner Zinke's question about relocating the garage, which had been mentioned prior, Mr. Myszka stated he wanted to relocate the garage with the driveway in mind, so that it opened up the corner lot, but he wanted to speak with Mr. Bishop first about that relocation.

Chairman Roy clarified and reminded the commissioners of the various projects they had approved over time and that it was important to let the property evolve over time, but to make sure it was sympathetic with the surrounding area and to preserve the character of the building. For further clarification, Lambert discussed one of the SOI standards which referred to additions attaining significance in their own right and the fact that if the screened porch were to be kept, the question to ask was had it attained significance to stand on its own? Also, the National Park Service, in their review of buildings, also suggest that any additions and modifications made on a historic structure were, ideally, made at the rear of a building, which was where the modifications for this structure are proposed. It was also brought to the commission's attention that if the garage/carriage house were relocated, it would look strange with a second-story porch on pilings. Asked their thoughts on the historic contribution of the screened porch, Commissioner Hiller did not feel it was consistent with the character and style of the rest of the house. Chairman Roy was also under the impression that since the commission did not vote on the relocation of the garage during the last meeting, the consensus going forward was that it was fine with the commissioners to move it. Lastly, clarification followed that the garage/carriage barn was original and it was moved twice, as documented. It was being saved because it was contributing, while the porch was not. **Commissioner Zinke moved to approve the demolition of the screened porch and alteration of the historic bulkhead, as presented, seconded by Hiller. Roll call:**

Aye: Hiller, Shock-Soderberg, Zinke, Roy
Nay: None

MOTION CARRIED. VOTE: 4-0

5. Concept Review

A. SW Corner of Fifth & Campbell Streets - Lot 2 (Case No. 2014-005): Proposed Infill Residence; Applicant: Avondale Custom Homes - Maurice McNally/ Dave Myszka -

Mr. Lambert presented the elevations and floor plans for the proposed in-fill home on the former Merritt King property. The residence will be on an open parcel to the north of the former Merritt King house, at the corner of Fifth and Campbell Streets.

Mr. Dave Myszka with K. Peterson Associates and architect for the project, reviewed the proposed elevations, noting the home will have a six and one-half feet wide front porch (to the east) and the home's material will consist of siding, asphalt shingles, lower base brick, and fenestrations around the windows. A detached carriage house will incorporate the third car garage with materials consisting of brick, siding and heavy bracketry on the garage. A backyard will be created. The garage will be set off the street as much as possible to break up the massing and to avoid a flat look. The proposed plan does meet the City's zoning ordinance. The front porch may be constructed wider based on previous commissioner comments.

Commissioners voiced positive comments overall but there was a concern about the number of garage doors facing Campbell Street and if the smaller garage could be placed not facing Campbell Street. Chairman Roy suggested removing some of the brick on the smaller carriage house to lighten the massing. Per Commissioner Zinke's question, Mr. Myszka confirmed he was still working on the four houses with a re-review of the design. As to sharing a driveway, Mr. Myszka was also looking at other possibilities but also stated he was trying to create a friendly backyard area. Adding an alley was a concern of his because he did not want the current neighbors looking at an alley, wherein Commissioner Zinke commented on her recent trip to South Carolina and stated that many of the homes in the historic district there had alleys but hid them behind hedges. Lastly, commissioners asked for a streetscape view in future applications.

Resident, Ms. Liz Safanda, 1013 Dunstan Road, Geneva, appreciated the plans for a modest home that was not overwhelming in size and blended in with the surrounding homes. She believed it was a good compromise and hoped to see similar plans.

6. Secretary's Report (Staff Update)

Mr. Lambert announced that 526 S. Fourth Street has received a demolition award and the demolition is scheduled as early as tomorrow. He announced that commissioners will now be emailed a link to the Agenda Center for future packets. Commissioners were updated on staff's progress for Preservation Month. Discussions still continue on the Mill Race Inn.

7. New Business

A. From the Commission - Commissioner Hiller met with reps from the Geneva History Museum and Preservation Partners to coordinate their Preservation Week activities. The HPC's portion will be about awareness. Hiller shared a sample poster depicting photographs of buildings "then" and "now" which will be placed in various businesses along Third Street for the public to view. His goal is to place posts in 12 buildings. Details followed. Lambert also stated there has been no formal proclamation for Preservation Month for several years and asked the commissioners if they wanted the process returned. Commissioners supported its return.

B. From the Public - None.

8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:50 p.m. on motion by Commissioner Schock-Soderberg, seconded by Commissioner Hiller. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote.