

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MINUTES
City of Geneva – Public Works, Training Room
1800 South Street, Geneva, Illinois**

February 17, 2009

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Roy called the Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. at Geneva City Hall, 109 James Street, Geneva, Illinois.

ROLL CALL

Present HPC: Chairman Roy, Commissioners Adams, Andersson, Bruno, Gallagher, Hiller, Hansen
Others Present: HPC Planner Kaulfuss; Liz Safanda, Executive Director of Preservation Partners of the Fox Valley;
Recording Secretary Celeste Weilandt

Roll call followed and a quorum was established.

MEETING MINUTES

January 20, 2009 HPC Meeting - Minutes were approved on motion by Commissioner Gallagher, seconded by Commissioner Adams. Motion carried by voice vote of 6-0-1 (Hansen abstains) Motion passed.

BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION REVIEWS

301 S. Third Street – Geneva Lutheran Church, Exterior Rehabilitation, Site Improvements

Presenters: Celine Coath of Jaeger, Nickola & Associates, Ltd, Pastor Opp and Steve Chippas, Geneva Lutheran Church, Damian Eallonardo, Skender Construction

Applicant, Pastor Opp, introduced himself, noting he has been Pastor with Geneva Lutheran Church for the past 16 months. Project Manager Mr. Steven Chippas, with AECOM, introduced Ms. Celine Coath with Jaeger, Nickola & Associates, Ltd. Architects, from Park Ridge, Illinois, and General Contractor Mr. Damian Eallonardo, with Skender Construction from Palos Hills, Illinois. Mr. Chippas discussed the history of the congregation, noting the building was in its fourth location and has not been significantly altered since 1955 nor has it been re-roofed since that time. The main issues under discussion included the re-roofing of the building in its entirety, creating a front entrance with canopy, and constructing a new sign monument.

Ms. Celine Coath, handed out a photometric plan of the bollards for the parking area, a revised rooftop plan, and a sample of the roof snow guard for the sloped areas of the roof and main canopy.

Reviewing the site plan, she pointed out the changes to occur: The west canopy will be new with skylights. A two-sided monument sign will be constructed and meet the required total area of 40 sq. feet. The sidewalk to Third Street will be extended and edged with a paver border to match the border of the Mother's Garden. Three (3) handicap stalls have been reconfigured with bollards (brick with stone cap) and will be screened with low-growing bushes. A smaller north canopy will be added to the building which will reflect the same banding of the church building. A new wooden gate (stained to complement the building) is planned for the south elevation.

Discussing the main west canopy, Ms. Coath stated there will be skylights added to allow in light. A black slate "look-alike" material is being considered for the roof which uses recycled materials. Snow guards were pointed out on the roof plan. Internally, a few light sconces will be added to allow some soft light within the area. As to how the east side of the canopy ties into the main building, Ms. Coath confirmed it back-pitches to the flat roof with the remaining portions to empty off using scuppers. Ms. Coath confirmed the roof in the back would be higher and drain on the lower roof.

Per a question, the pitch of the new canopy roof will be slightly different than the gable ends of the church, with the intention of the canopy to be looked at as a new building element. Ms. Coath reminded the commissioners that they did not want to match the original pitch because it did not look right. Turning the discussion to the flat roof, Ms. Coath stated that new mechanical equipment proposed for the roof has been setback and will include gray screening.

Addressing the monument sign for Third Street, Ms. Coath explained the sign will not be backlit. It will include the name of the church with an interchangeable text message board. A light inside the glass panel, and above the message board, will be pointed downwards illuminating the message board. Andersson confirmed the lighting will be shining downward on the bollards and monument sign. Dialog followed on the flood lighting around the message board and possibly reducing the ground lighting or decreasing the wattage of the lights. Sign letters will be large enough to convey the time of worship. The height of the monument sign will be 8' feet 8" inches. Kaulfuss stated the sign's height met code and was out of the visibility triangle.

Ms. Coath stated the three doors on the existing building will be changed because they have a metal exterior with rusting rivets. The interior of the door is wooden. The applicant intends to work with Staff on this specific matter. Stained glass vertical bands exist on the doors and the congregation would like to retain that. Asked if the doors could be repaired, Mr. Chippas discussed the current material and its deterioration. In addition, he stated the new doors would need to meet code upgrades including such things as panic hardware, etc.

Per another question, Ms. Coath stated the brick proposed for the canopies and the brick pavers proposed for the sidewalks would match as close as possible to the existing brick of the church and of the pavers at the mother's garden. As to the color of the roof shingles, Commissioner Bruno was concerned about the new dark gray color contrasting with the building. Another choice was a "Federal" gray and the petitioner's concern was that it would be too light. The main canopy lighting will include low glow sconces/one tone metal and uplights. The other canopy will probably have underside lighting. Per the applicant, the lighting around the building still needs to be fine-tuned.

Concern was raised by Commissioner Hiller regarding the large size of the monument sign and its blocking the sightline of the church, wherein Mr. Chippas stated the applicant wanted the public to be able to read the sign from the street and the perspective was fine. Per Commissioner Hansen's question, the new sidewalk will be poured concrete, four-feet wide, with banding to direct pedestrians and congregation. The north canopy roof line will drain to one side but, visually, the fascia will remain.

Chairman Roy stated the commissioners appeared to be in agreement with the overall character of the monument sign except for its size and scale. Ms. Coath was open to reviewing the monument again, noting the details and same shape would probably remain. Dialog followed to separate the two issues. Chairman Roy suggested that the applicant do a mock-up of the monument. Commissioner Andersson suggested having the monument sign issue return to the HPC. Due to permitting issues, Mr. Chippas asked the commissioners for a maximum height recommendation. Per a question about tree preservation, Kaulfuss stated that preservation of the large evergreen is not required, but that the applicant must complete a tree preservation plan indicating which trees will be retained and which will be removed.

Pastor. Opp commented that the size of the monument will have to be looked at from the perspective of what the church wants to display in the sign case before determining the size of the monument. Chairman Roy agreed. Commissioners agreed to have the applicant provide a mock-up of the monument sign. Commissioner Adams moved to approve all of the changes for 301 S. Third Street, as presented, with the incorporation of the changes on the drawings dated 2/17/09 and handed out at the meeting, with the exception of the new monument sign and the exterior doors. The exterior doors will be reviewed by staff. The monument sign will be scaled down and returned for review. Seconded by Commissioner Bruno.

ROLL CALL

Y ADAMS Y ANDERSSON Y BRUNO Y GALLAGHER Y HANSEN Y HILLER Y ROY
MOTION CARRIED: VOTE 7-0

422 S. Fourth Street – New Single Family Residential Building

Presenter: Paul Lankenau, Havlicek Builders

On behalf of the owner/applicant, Mr. Paul Lankenau with Havlicek Buildings, Geneva, Illinois, explained he is proposing to construct a new home on a vacant lot at the corner of South Street and Fourth Street for a client currently living in Mill Creek. He intends to retain most of the existing trees on the lot except for one 32" inch Locust west of the garage. The home has a corner porch for a nice view of the street corner. The garage will face Fourth Street as do the two other homes to the north. The home directly to the north is set back 35 feet from the street which the placement of the new home will match. The garage will be setback 40'-0" from the property line.

While Mr. Lankenau acknowledged staff's concern about setting the garage back further, Mr. Lankenau stated he was concerned about that because it would require him to remove the large Locust tree. Per Kaulfuss, the applicant was required to provide a tree preservation plan and state which trees would be preserved and which would be removed. Commissioner Bruno stated that with the close proximity of the tree behind the garage, there was concern about even saving the tree. Kaulfuss stated the tree arborist looked over the Locust tree noting it was a sensitive tree as to tree root damage. Mr. Lankenau stated he also spoke with the arborist who sounded encouraging to him.

Continuing, Mr. Lankenau stated the height of the home was brought down 1-1/2 feet while the maximum height allowed was 35 feet. The applicant was approximately three inches under that. As to the height of the house to the south, Mr. Lankenau surmised it was probably more than 35 feet. Adams preferred that the proposed home's height be lower than that home due to the context of the neighborhood. Commissioner Gallagher supported the way the builder was strategizing the plans for the house, i.e., placing the mass lower at the four points and higher in the center. Per Gallagher's questions, the siding would be Hardiplank, windows to be Pella aluminum clad, and trim to be cedar. Shutters would be vinyl. Discussion followed on the height of the first floor risers, noting the owner and Mr. Lankenau drove around the neighborhood to get ideas. The intentions of the owner's porch were discussed, i.e., she wanted an outdoor living space. The depth of the porch was approximately 7 feet with the corner area being 10' feet by 12' feet.

Regarding the proposed garage, Mr. Lankenau stated the two homes to the north had garages placed 35 to 36 feet back from the property line, while the proposed garage was 40 feet from the line. He pointed out the proposed garage allowed a clear line of view of the neighbors' backyards. Chairman Roy favored saving the tree and not moving the garage. Adams, noting it was a corner lot, also agreed he would support the proposal. Bruno sympathized keeping the neighbors' rear views. Kaulfuss pointed out that the garage was not two-story as others.

Regarding staff's comment on the front steps, Mr. Lankenau explained that the proposed porch was a brick veneer on the front but the top was a concrete surface. While staff preferred brick risers or stone steps, he stated the owner was sympathetic but has not agreed to that suggestion. He did not believe the owner would be open to wooden stairs as she was trying to make the home low maintenance. Gallagher pointed out several homes located on the other side of Dodson Place had a similar approach. Gallagher moved to approve the proposal for 422 S. Fourth Street, as presented. Seconded by Adams.

ROLL CALL

Y ADAMS Y ANDERSSON Y BRUNO Y GALLAGHER Y HANSEN Y HILLER Y ROY

MOTION CARRIED: VOTE 7-0

STAFF UPDATE AND PROJECT LIST

Kaulfuss stated the Preservation Month subcommittee met once already and would be meeting again shortly. So far topics have included holding walking tours, having a speaker, and the Illinois Historic Preservation Commission to speak on May 13, 2009 about modern architecture, ranch houses. Networking will follow. On May 16th a hands-on workshop will be held to show how to repair windows and siding.

Chairman Roy, Commissioner Andersson, and staff met recently to review the Design Guidelines. Kaulfuss will produce an outline to get their feedback.

No other news has been received on the Stackman case. The joint meeting with the City Council is planned for May 26, 2009.

A short dialog followed on the prior 422 S. Fourth Street proposal with Kaulfuss explaining some of revisions that took place. Initially, the applicant did not comply with zoning but the plans were revised to meet the zoning.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Historic Preservation Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 8:21 p.m. on motion by Adams, seconded by Andersson. Motion carried unanimously.