

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

City of Geneva
109 James Street - City Council Chambers

June 20, 2023

Call to Order

Chairman Zellmer called to order the June 20, 2023 Meeting of the Geneva Historic Preservation Commission at 7:00 pm.

1. Roll Call

Present: Chairman Zellmer and Commissioners Hartman, Jensen, McManus, Phillips, Salomon, Stazin

Absent: None

Staff Present: Preservation Planner Michael Lambert

Others Present: City Attorney Ron Sandack, Court Reporter Theresa A. Vorkapic - PlanetDepos

2. Approval of Minutes

Minutes of March 14, 2023 - **Motion by Commissioner Jensen to approve the minutes as presented; second by Commissioner McManus. A roll call vote followed; motion passed 6-0 with Commissioner Phillips abstaining.**

Minutes of May 30, 2023 - **Motion by Commissioner Stazin to approve the minutes as presented; second by Commissioner Hartman. A roll call vote followed; motion passed unanimously, 7-0.**

3. Continuation of Public Hearing (from January 18, 2023)

A. 4 East State Street CASE 2022-079 & 2022-080 Applicant: David A. Patzelt, Authorized Representative Shodeen Family Foundation. Application for: Demolition of a Historic Landmark and Designation of the Property.

Chairman Zellmer stated that the purpose of this evening's public hearing is to receive a response from the City's consultant team, Teska Associates and the Planera Group. Chairman Zellmer continued to state that the Commission can ask the consultant questions, but because the applicant's representative, Mr. Patzelt is not able to attend this meeting, there will be no other testimony given at this meeting.

Motion by Commissioner Salomon to open the public hearing; second by Commissioner Hartman. A roll call vote followed; motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

Scott Goldstein of Teska Associates began by introducing himself and stated that, tonight, he represents both Teska Associates and the Planera Group. Teska Associates and the Planera Group were engaged by the City of Geneva to analyze the pro forma statement submitted by the Applicant as part of the Applicant's application for demolition of a historic property located at 4 East State Street. As part of their analysis, Teska Associates and the Planera Group interviewed the applicant and 14 developers, real estate and historic preservation practitioners, and consulted industry standards. Mr. Goldstein presented an updated analysis to address eight major comments made by the applicant at the previous public hearing. The revised report included clarification or updated data in these areas: Analysis of Alternative Uses of the Site; Land Costs of Historic Site; Leasing Fees; Federal Historic Tax Credits; Return on Investment; Internal Rate of Return; Analysis of Stand-Alone Scenarios; Analysis of a 4-Story As-Of-Right Development; and Analysis of 4-Story with Partial 5th Floor. The final slide presented a summary of key findings that reported a stand-alone reuse of the historic building would provide a 1.3% ROI (Return on Investment), annually. If a public investment (such as TIF funds) was included for the stand-alone project, it would yield 10% ROI. Therefore, the consultant's analysis concluded that the reuse of the historic building as a stand-alone project that includes a public-private investment is a viable alternative to demolition. Development of the full site at 4 East State Street would yield a similar ROI with or without renovation of the historic building; however, the ROI would be driven by the larger site development.

The Commissioners asked Mr. Goldstein questions to clarify issues raised in the presentation.

Chairman Zellmer stated public testimony is anticipated to be concluded at the next public hearing and the Applicant will be provided a time for a closing statement.

Motion by Commissioner McManus to continue the public hearing to the next regularly scheduled meeting on July 18, 2023; second by Commissioner Salomon. A roll call vote followed; motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

4. Secretary's Report (Staff Updates)

None

5. New Business

A. From the Commission: None

B. From the Public: None

7. Adjournment

At 7:33 pm Commissioner Salomon made a motion to adjourn the meeting; seconded by Commissioner Stazin. A voice vote followed; motion passed unanimously, 7-0.